



**SDI Review Form 1.5**

**PART A:**

|                          |                                                                                                                |
|--------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">British Journal of Applied Science &amp; Technology</a>                                            |
| Manuscript Number:       | <b>MS: 2012/BJAST/1789</b>                                                                                     |
| Title of the Manuscript: | <b>VAPOR-LIQUID EQUILIBRIUM CALCULATION OF MULTI-COMPONENTS SYSTEM WITH ESTIMATION OF PRE-HEAT TEMPERATURE</b> |

*(Note: Title of different sections as proposed below may differ in case of review paper)*



## SDI Review Form 1.5

### **PART B: Review Comments**

|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | <b>Reviewer's comment</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | <b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part and write here 'Corrected' if not agreed, give suitable justifications)                                                                             |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>General comment:</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | <b>The proposed method should be further validated by giving concrete deviation information (compared with exp or other methods).<br/>There are quite many grammatical and typo mistakes, such as P/p, line 181, 186, equ 2.23, and so on.<br/>The pre-heat temperature should be further explained. The issue was not very clear.</b> | Corrected                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
| <b>Specific comments:</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | The scatters in the figures are too big, which may mislead the readers. It is better to give numbers about the deviation instead of only showing in the figure.                                                                                                                                                                        | corrected                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
| <b>Title and abstract</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| <b>Introduction</b> (Is the problem/objective of this study original, important and well defined?)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | The significance of this work should be enhanced.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | Corrected                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
| Are all the references cited relevant, adequate? Are there any other suitable current references authors need to cite?                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| <b>Materials &amp; methods</b> (Kindly comment on the suitability of the methods. Sufficient details of the methods should be provided to allow peers to evaluate and/or replicate the work)                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| <b>Results &amp; discussion</b> (Kindly comment on: 1. Are the data well controlled and robust? 2. Authors should provide relevant references during discussion. 3. Discussion and conclusions should be based on actual facts and figures. Biased claims should be pointed out. 4. Are statistical analyses must for this paper? If yes, have sufficient and appropriate statistical analyses been carried out?) | No discussions regarding the results. Results are not sufficient to validate the proposed method.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | Corrected. The major results in flash calculation have been provided (even with an extension into pre-heat temperature and flow rates) and the needed further discussions on results newly carried out will definitely help in validating the method |
| Are there any ethical or competing interest issues?                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| <b>Conclusion</b> (Is the conclusion supported by the data, discussed inside the manuscript? Conclusions should not be biased and should be based on the data, presented inside the manuscript only)                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| References                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |